

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revision proposal for RDA 6.28.3, Authorized Access Point Representing a Musical Expression

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for their proposal to clarify RDA 6.28.3, to ensure that appropriate instructions in RDA 6.27.3 may also be applied. We support the intent of the proposal and offer the following comments and rewording suggestions.

6.11, *Language of Expression*

Agree to delete reference to instructions for expressions of musical works.

6.18.1.4, *Arrangements, Transcriptions, Etc.*

- ALA supports clarification of 6.18.1.4; however, we would prefer a different approach that uses an if/then construction for the first paragraph and provides a separate paragraph to refer to appropriate instructions for substantive changes that result in new works.
- For clarity and consistency with other RDA instructions, we have changed the phrase “or part or parts of a work” to “or a part or parts of a work”.
- We agree with the JSC Music Working Group that the “Added Accompaniments, Etc.” instruction does not belong in the revised 6.28.3. However, instead of creating an exception in 6.28.3.1, we recommend addressing this situation in 6.18.1.4. We have suggested a “Do not apply” paragraph in our proposed revision below.
- We agree with changing the current 6.18.1.4.1 to an Exception to this instruction.

Because our changes below are extensive, we have only provided a clean copy.

Clean copy, to replace all of 6.18.1.4

6.18.1.4 Arrangements, Transcriptions, Etc.

If:

the expression is an arrangement, transcription, etc. of a work or a part or parts of a work by one composer

and

the modifications are of a nature that does not result in a new work (e.g., a change in medium of performance, a simplified version)

then:

record *arranged*.

Apply this instruction also to a transcription by the original composer.

Do not apply this instruction when instrumental accompaniment or additional parts have been added to a work or a part or parts of a work.

Exception

If the arrangement, transcription, etc. is of a work or a part or parts of a work that belongs, broadly speaking, to the category of music in the “popular” idiom (e.g., rock, jazz), record *arranged* only if the expression is:

either

a) an instrumental work arranged for vocal or choral performance

or

b) a vocal work arranged for instrumental performance

For substantial modifications that result in a new work, apply the instructions at [6.14](#).

6.27.3, *Authorized Access Point Representing an Expression*

- ALA agrees with the addition of “authorized” to the 1st paragraph; however, we note that the same change should be made to 6.29.2 and 6.31.2, which have the same problem.
- ALA reviewers expressed some discomfort with including the first new proposed paragraph, “If the resource described contains more than one language expression of the work, construct authorized access points for each of the expressions.” We recognize that this same instruction appears in 6.30.3.2, *Authorized Access Point Representing an Expression of the Bible*; however, this instruction seems out of place for an instruction that is limited to “a particular expression”. In addition, the phrasing identifies only one kind of resource that contains multiple expressions.

In spite of these concerns, ALA is willing to accept the inclusion of this paragraph; however, we recommend removing “language” from the instruction to broaden its application; this seems especially important in the context of music resources:

If the resource described contains more than one language expression of the work, construct authorized access points for each of the expressions.

- ALA welcomes the addition of references to the special instructions in 6.28–6.31.

6.28.3, *General Guidelines on Constructing Authorized Access Points Representing Musical Expressions*

Preferred approach

- ALA agrees with the JSC Music Working Group’s analysis (Other Alternatives, page 2) that the instructions in 6.28.3.2–6.28.3.6 could be removed, since their equivalent instructions are already in 6.18. None of the other instructions regarding the construction of authorized access points in 6.27–6.31 duplicate, or nearly duplicate, the instructions

for recording the preferred title earlier in Chapter 6. ALA prefers this approach, although we recognize the importance of retaining the examples for the specific situations addressed by the current instructions. Our proposed revision suggests one way to solve this problem.

Our revision:

- Takes a different approach to 6.28.3.1, listing all of the possible elements, with the corresponding instruction references.
- Removes the Exception in 6.28.3.1, since the exception follows the primary instruction. ALA believes that the exceptional situation is that added instrumental accompaniment or added parts are not considered an arrangement; with this in mind, cataloguers should follow the primary instruction. As indicated above, we recommend addressing added accompaniments/parts in 6.18.1.4 instead.
- Changes the phrase “or part or parts of a work” to “or a part or parts of a work”.
- Uses separate example boxes for different types of musical expressions. With two exceptions, we have used the label “resource described” instead of “authorized access point for”. In addition, we have provided a citation for the resource for all of the Sketches examples; this information is currently lacking in RDA 6.28.3.4.
- Eliminates all specific sub-instructions.

Because our changes below are extensive, we have only provided a clean copy.

Clean copy, to replace all of 6.28.3

6.28.3 Authorized Access Point Representing a Musical Expression

6.28.3.1 General Guidelines on Constructing Authorized Access Points Representing Musical Expressions

Construct an authorized access point representing a particular expression of a musical work or a part or parts of a musical work by combining (in this order):

- a) the authorized access point representing the work (see **6.28.1**) or the part or parts of a work (see **6.28.2**)
- b) one or more of the following elements, as applicable:
 - i) other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work: arrangements, transcriptions, etc. (see **6.18.1.4**), sketches (see **6.18.1.5**), vocal and chorus scores (see **6.18.1.6**)
 - ii) the content type (**6.9**)
 - iii) the date of the expression (see **6.10**)
 - iv) the language of the expression (see **6.11**)

and/or

- v) another distinguishing characteristic of the expression (see 6.12).

EXAMPLE

Arrangements, Transcriptions, Etc.

Berlioz, Hector, 1803–1869. *Le corsaire*; arranged

Resource described: *The corsaire* : overture for concert band / transcribed by Gunther Schuller. **Transcription of a Berlioz overture composed originally for orchestra**

Respighi, Ottorino, 1879–1936. *Gli uccelli*; arranged

Resource described: *The birds* / Respighi. **Arranged for Japanese instruments by H. Okano**

Schubert, Franz, 1797–1828. *Octet*, clarinet, horn, bassoon, violins, viola, violoncello, double bass, D. 803, F major; arranged

Resource described: *Grosses Octet für zwei Violinen, Viola, Violoncello, Contrabass, Horn, Fagott und Clarinette*, op. 166 / komponiert von Franz Schubert ; Arrangement für das Pianoforte zu vier Händen bearbeitet von S. Leithner. **Arranged for piano, four hands**

Ravel, Maurice, 1875–1937. *Pavane pour une infante défunte*; arranged

Resource described: *Pavane pour une infante défunte* : pour petit orchestre / Maurice Ravel. **Originally for piano; transcription by the composer**

Satie, Erik, 1866–1925. *Piano music. Selections*; arranged

Resource described: *Pièces pour guitare* / Erik Satie. **Selected piano works by Satie transcribed for guitar**

MacDermot, Galt. *Hair*; arranged

Resource described: *Hair* '72 : the American tribal love-rock musical / [lyrics] by James Rado, Gerome Ragni ; [music by] Galt MacDermot ; concert band arranged by Len Goldstyne. **Vocal music arranged for band**

Townshend, Pete. *Songs. Selections*; arranged

Resource described: *Who's serious* : symphonic music of the Who. **Selected rock songs by Townshend arranged for orchestra**

Brubeck, Dave. *Blue rondo à la Turk*; arranged

Resource described: *Blue rondo à la Turk* : SSAATTBB a cappella / music, Dave Brubeck ; arr. Ward Swingle. **Originally written for jazz quartet; arranged for unaccompanied mixed chorus**

John, Elton. *Candle in the wind*; arranged

Resource described: *Candle in the wind* / music by Elton John ; words by Bernie Taupin ; arranged by Michael Sweeney. **Song arranged for jazz ensemble**

but

Carmichael, Hoagy, 1899–1981. *Songs. Selections*

Resource described: *Hoagy Carmichael* : a choral portrait : for S.A.B. voices and piano with optional guitar, bass, drums, and vibraphone / music by Hoagy Carmichael ; arranged by Robert Sterling. **Selected songs by Carmichael arranged for accompanied choral performance**

Brubeck, Dave. *Blue rondo à la Turk*

Resource described: *Blue rondo à la Turk* / Dave Brubeck ; arranged for string quartet by Jeremy Cohen. **Originally written for jazz quartet**

Deep river

Resource described: *Deep river* / transcription by Hugo Frey. **An arrangement for voice and piano of the spiritual**

EXAMPLE

Sketches

Szymanowski, Karol, 1882-1937. Harnasie (Sketches)

Resource described: Harnasie : facsimile szkicu partytury / Karol Szymanowski

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827. Quartets, violins, viola, cello, no. 1-6, op. 18 (Sketches)

Resource described: Ein Skizzenbuch zu Streichquartetten aus op. 18 / Beethoven

Gillis, Don, 1912-1978. Quartets, violin, viola, cello, no. 6. Passacaglia (Sketches)

Resource described: Sketches for passacaglia (used in Quartet VI) / Gillis, Don

Moore, Douglas, 1893-1969. Works. Selections (Sketches)

Resource described: Sketches / Douglas Moore

EXAMPLE

Vocal and Chorus Scores

Rameau, Jean-Philippe, 1683-1764. Hippolyte et Aricie. 1733. Vocal score

Resource described: Hippolyte et Aricie : version 1733 : tragédie en musique en un prologue et cinq actes : RCT 43 / Jean-Philippe Rameau ; livret de Simon-Joseph Pellegrin ; édition de Sylvie Bouissou. — Réduction clavierchant / de François Saint-Yves. **A score**

Sullivan, Arthur, 1842-1900. The Mikado. Chorus score

Resource described: The Mikado, or, The town of Titipu : choruses / by W.S. Gilbert and Arthur Sullivan

Wagner, Richard, 1813-1883. Operas. Vocal scores

Resource described: Richard Wagner's Werke : Opern und Musikdramen : vollständiger Klavierauszug

EXAMPLE

Content Type

Monk, Thelonious. Crepuscule with Nellie. Notated music

Resource described: Crepuscule with Nellie / Thelonious Monk ; arranged by Don Sickler. **A score with parts for a jazz sextet**

EXAMPLE

Language of the Expression

Handel, George Frideric, 1685-1759. Messiah. German

Resource described: Der Messias / G.F. Händel. **A German translation**

EXAMPLE

Multiple Elements

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827. Symphonies, no. 6, op. 68, F major; arranged (Sitt).
Notated music

Resource described: Symphonie IV, Op. 68 für Pianoforte und Violine : (Pastorale) / Beethoven ; arrangirt von Hans Sitt. **A score**

Haydn, Joseph, 1732-1809. Die Schöpfung. Vocal score. English

Resource described: The creation : an oratorio / the music by Joseph Haydn. — Vocal score with a separate accompaniment for the organ, or pianoforte / arranged by Vincent Novello. **Text is in English**

Berlioz, Hector, 1803-1869. Les nuits d'été; arranged. Vocal score

Resource described: Les nuits d'été : six mélodies avec un petit orchestre / Hector Berlioz ; edited by Ian Kemp. — Vocal score / Douglas Woodfull-Harris. **Originally for voice and piano, revised and orchestrated by the composer; orchestra accompaniment arranged for piano**

Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791. Le nozze di Figaro. German. Performed music.

Resource described: Die Hochzeit des Figaro / Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart. **A performance sung in a German translation**

Monnot, Marguerite. Hymne à l'amour. English. Performed music (Lynn)

Authorized access point for a performance by Vera Lynn in an English translation.

Monnot, Marguerite. Hymne à l'amour. English. Performed music (Lauper)

Authorized access point for a performance by Cindy Lauper in an English translation

Alternative approach

- If the JSC prefers the proposal's approach to 6.28.3, we recommend:
 - Replacing the proposed wording for 6.28.3.1.a and 6.28.3.1.b with our suggested text for 6.28.3.1 above.
 - Removing “as applicable” in 6.28.3.1.a if the proposal's wording for 6.28.3.1 is preferred. This term is not in the equivalent instructions in 6.27.3 or 6.30.3.1.
 - Removing the exception in 6.28.3.1, for the reasons noted above. ALA observes that the final proposed sentence (“If it is considered important...”) is a change to the current RDA instructions, and that the example does not illustrate this point.
 - Revising 6.28.3.2 to correspond with our recommended wording for 6.18.1.4, as detailed below.
 - Changing the phrase “or part or parts of a work” to “or a part or parts of a work”.
 - Replacing the phrase “resource being described” with “expression” in the first sentence of the Exception. If the JSC agrees with this substitution, the other occurrences of this phrase in Chapter 6 should also be evaluated.

Because our changes below are extensive, we have only provided a clean copy.

Clean copy, to replace the text of 6.28.3.2

6.28.3.2 Arrangements, Transcriptions, Etc.

If:

the expression is an arrangement, transcription, etc. of a work or a part or parts of a work by one composer

and

the modifications are of a nature that does not result in a new work (e.g., a change in medium of performance, a simplified version)

then:

add the term *arranged* to the authorized access point for the work or a part or parts of the work.

Apply this instruction also to a transcription by the original composer.

[examples unchanged from proposal]

Exception

If the arrangement, etc. is of a work or part or parts of a work that belongs, broadly speaking, to the category of music in the “popular” idiom (e.g., rock, jazz), add the term *arranged* to the authorized access point for the work or a part or parts of the work only if the expression is:

either

a) an instrumental work arranged for vocal or choral performance

or

b) a vocal work arranged for instrumental performance

[examples from proposal]