

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: New Chapter 3 elements for *Optical Disc Data Storage Format* and *Optical Disc Recording Method*

Thanks to ALA and OLAC for the further work on the instructions for optical discs in RDA. We are generally in agreement with the intended outcome, but have several questions and comments about the proposal and the impact on sections of RDA not mentioned.

Change #1. Create RDA 3.22, Optical Disc Data Storage Format

Agree with the basics of the proposed new instruction, but we have the following comments:

1. Placement of instruction: it would seem more logical to us to insert the new element at 3.21, rather than inserting this element between the two note elements currently at 3.21 and 3.22. However, if others agree, we wouldn't mind breaking the general order model even more significantly and placing this element at 3.23 to avoid any renumbering.
2. Overlap with 3.19.3 (Encoding Format): we would like to understand the distinction between *Optical Disc Data Storage Format* and *Encoding Format*, currently part of 3.19 (Digital File Characteristic). The concepts seem very close, and terms in the vocabularies are also very similar (e.g., Blu-ray for Encoding Format vs. Blu-ray Disc for Optical Data Disc Storage Format).

We are unsure if these concepts are distinct enough that separate instructions at different elements are needed, or if 3.19.3 should be revised to include instructions about optical disc data storage format. If separate elements are needed, revisions to 3.19.3 should be made to clarify the difference, make appropriate references, and revise the terms at 3.19.3.3. If optical disc data storage format is so closely related to encoding format that placing instructions at different elements seems unnecessarily complex, perhaps 3.19.3 could be re-captioned to be more general, with specific instructions for optical disc data storage format at a sub-instruction.

3. Caption proposed for 3.22.1.3 is missing the word "Disc".
4. Is there a reason that "Disc" in "Blue-ray Disc" is capitalized?
5. Would there be a need for a "Details of Optical Disc Data Storage Format" at 3.22.1.4 to describe complex situations, or would vocabulary terms always be sufficient?

Change #2.

Add Optical discs to the Exceptions in 3.9.1.3:

Response: We agree.

Create RDA 3.9.4, Production Method for Optical Disc:

Response: We generally agree, with the following comments:

1. Is it necessary to have the word “disc” as part of the vocabulary term that is only for discs? Would “stamped” and “burned” suffice? See the list at 3.9.3.3 for a model for terms in this element.
2. We think the information intended to be conveyed by the Optional Addition may be better suited to the “Details of Production Methods for Optical Discs” element. We noted that the proposed terms include "prefixes" that are the same as terms for the new element Optical Disc Data Storage Format. For example, DVD+R includes the 3.22.1.3 term "DVD" as well as "+R," which seems to mean "recordable." In addition, the proposed identical definitions (see our comment in Change #3) lead us to believe there are only four types of burned discs. In essence, for burned discs, there seem to be these possible types:

Recordable

Recordable and erasable

Rewritable

Written to, erased, and re-recorded.

Change #3. Vocabulary definitions

1. The definitions need to be re-formulated in the style used for RDA vocabularies, e.g., to identify the element the vocabulary term comes from. For example:

Blue-ray Disc An optical disc data storage format for a

2. In the definitions of Blue-ray Disc, CD, and DVD, it uses “120 mm” to reflect the diameter of the disc, but the instructions at 3.5.1.3 for dimensions say to use centimeters as the unit of measurement. We suggest that “120 mm” be replaced by “12 cm”.
3. We note that some proposed vocabulary terms have definitions that are identical to other definitions (DVD+R and DVD-R; DVD+RW and DVD-RW). If these are distinct terms, their definitions should represent the differences.